Business and Management Doctorates World-Wide

Developing the Next Generation

Nicola J. Palmer, Julie Davies and Clare Viney

Business and Management Doctorates World-Wide

This page intentionally left blank

Business and Management Doctorates World-Wide: Developing the Next Generation

BY

NICOLA J. PALMER Sheffield Hallam University, UK & University of York, UK

JULIE DAVIES

University College London, UK

AND

CLARE VINEY

Careers Research and Advisory Centre (CRAC) Limited, UK



United Kingdom - North America - Japan - India - Malaysia - China

Emerald Publishing Limited Emerald Publishing, Floor 5, Northspring, 21-23 Wellington Street, Leeds LS1 4DL

First edition 2024

Copyright © 2024 Nicola J. Palmer, Julie Davies and Clare Viney. Published under exclusive licence by Emerald Publishing Limited.

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: www.copyright.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-78973-500-0 (Print) ISBN: 978-1-78973-499-7 (Online) ISBN: 978-1-78973-501-7 (Epub)



Outline of the Book: A Flow Diagram

Chapter 1 Growth patterns of business and management doctorates around the world. Outlines growth patterns of business and management doctorates and their historical emergence, how the PhD and DBA have evolved, and discusses different models and influences on them.

Chapter 2 Recruitment, selection and retention in business and management doctorates around the world. Explores issues relating to programme choice, recruitment, selection, and retention. Discusses doctoral pricing and fees and their impact on institutional funding models.

Chapter 3 The business school doctoral experience. Explores the concept of doctoral training, community building, supervision, doctoral assessment processes and practices, and quality assurance of the doctoral award.

Chapter 4 Employability, career management and post-doctoral outcomes in business and management. Examines employability, graduate outcomes, and career trajectories within and beyond academia, talent circulation, career management, and post-doctoral outcomes.

Chapter 5 Research environment, culture, capacity, capabilities and connectivity. Recognises and explores components and the impact of a supportive research environment and culture on doctoral programmes and candidates. Link: Highlights tensions between the strategic purpose and value of the doctorate from the perspective of providers, candidates, employers and/or funders within and beyond academia. Introduces different models globally and changing and challenging contexts.

Link: Analyses how institutional infrastructure and support, intrinsic motivation, and the financial and employment/student status of doctoral candidates can impact on retention and attrition rates. Looks at some of the recruitment barriers for under-represented groups and the effects on the research environment.

Link: Highlights how the doctoral journey may differ from the multiple perspectives of providers, candidates, and employers and/or funders. There is a focus on issues of agency and structure which invariably impact the quality and vicissitudes of the business school doctoral experience.

Link: Considers the potential for alignment between businesses and better business and management doctoral experiences, graduate outcomes, stronger links between industry and academia, and leading-edge creative practices. This page intentionally left blank

Contents

About the Authors	xi
Foreword	xii
Preface	xiv
Acknowledgements	XV

Chapter 1 Growth Patterns of Business and Management	
Doctorates Around the World	1
Overview	1
An Overall Increase in Doctoral Qualifications Worldwide	1
Elite Reproduction and Academic Excellence	2 5
Training for Research Excellence	5
Producing Business School Doctoral Graduates for the	
Knowledge Economy	7
The DBA as a Practice-Based and Work-Based Learning	
Approach to Doctoral Education	10
Differences and Similarities Between the PhD and	
DBA – Horses for Courses?	11
Institutional Strategic Aims of Business and Management	
Doctorates	13
Delivery of Business School Terminal Degrees as	
Executive Education	18
The Idea of a 'Modern Doctorate'	19
Changes During the COVID-19 Pandemic and	
Reflections on the Future	20
Summary	23
Chapter 2 Recruitment, Selection and Retention in Business and	
Management Doctorates Around the World	35
Overview	35
Who is Being Targeted for Business Doctorate Recruitment?	35
Recruiting to a Diverse and Inclusive Research Environment?	36

Pricing and Fees	38
Doctoral Admissions to Reproduce the Academy	42
Journeying across Boundaries	43
Variations in the Recruitment of Business School	
Doctorate Candidates	45
The Language of Application	46
Recruitment, Selection and Admissions	48
Retention of Business School Doctorate Candidates	51
Changes During the COVID-19 Pandemic and	
Future Prospects	55
Summary	56
Chapter 3 The Business School Doctoral Experience	69
Overview	69
Socialisation into Business and Management Doctoral Studies	69
Doctoral Communities	72
Progression, Quality Assurance and Assessment	75
Influences on the Shape of the Doctorate	77
Implications of Funded PGRs	79
Working While Completing a Doctorate	81
The Doctoral Examination	83
The Role of Academic Advisors and Supervisors in the	
Business Doctorate	84
The Business Doctorate as Doctoral Training for Whom?	88
Changes During the COVID-19 Pandemic and	
Future Prospects	91
Summary	92
Chapter 4 Employability, Career Management and	
Postdoctoral Outcomes in Business and Management	103
Overview	103
Brain Drain, Brain Gain and Business Doctorate Mobility:	
The Academic Career Market	103
Role Modelling Business School PhD Graduate Careers	105
Business School PhD Graduate Careers Beyond Academia	107
Career-Oriented Researcher Development Needs	109
DBA Impact on Careers – Key Challenges	110
Impactful DBA Programmes	111
Impacts that Hit Multiple Policy Agendas	112
Structural and Agentic Influences on the Impacts of	
Business Doctorates	115
Changes During the COVID-19 Pandemic and	
Reflections for the Future	117
Summary	117

Chapter 5 Research Environment, Culture, Capacity,	
Capabilities and Connectivity	125
Overview and Context	125
Business School Research Environments	125
Cultural Paradigms and the Business School Doctoral	
Research Environment	128
Research Culture and Organisational Behaviour	130
Professionalisation of Doctoral Supervision	131
Business Doctoral Education and Capacity Development	132
Mentoring, Social Capital and Capacity-Building	133
Mental Health and Well-Being and Diminished Capacity	135
Capabilities as Opportunities to Enable Being or Doing	137
Connectivity	138
Interdisciplinarity and Team Science	139
Looking to the Future of Business School Doctorates	140
Summary	140
Final Reflections	142

Index

153

This page intentionally left blank

About the Authors

Nicola J. Palmer has worked in Higher Education for over 25 years and in Doctoral Programmes Management for almost 15 years. She is an experienced Business School Doctoral Supervisor who, to date, has supervised 19 doctoral candidates to completion and examined over 20 candidates. She was one of the first doctoral supervisors to achieve UKCGE Research Supervisor Recognition and has won an Inspirational Research Supervisor award for her practice. Nicola served on the ESRC-initiated Northern Advanced Research Training Initiative (NARTI) Board 2014–2017 and the European Foundation for Management Development (EFMD) Doctoral Programmes Committee 2016–2022. She is an academic based in the Doctoral School at Sheffield Hallam University and the School for Business & Society at the University of York and is involved in the delivery of Research England funded projects on postgraduate research race equity and the transformation of doctoral supervision.

Julie Davies is a Professor in the Global Business School for Health at University College London, where she is Director of the MBA Health Programme. She earned her PhD in Strategic Management at Warwick University while working full time. Julie has worked in Business Schools for almost three decades and has facilitated Business School Deans' Development Programmes globally. Julie has completed the UKCGE Research Supervisor Recognition Programme and publishes research on impact and gender, hybrid leadership, ethnic minority micro-enterprises, and management education. She co-authored the *Routledge Book Leading a Business School*. Julie also served on EFMD's Doctoral Programmes Committee 2017–2022.

Clare Viney took up the role of Chief Executive Officer of CRAC in October 2016. She is a Strategic Leader with over 20 years' advocacy, policy and external affairs experience, and extensive experience in the not-for-profit sector. Clare is passionate about investing in future generations and those from diverse backgrounds and experiences, empowering people to realise their potential, and achieve their career and development goals. She currently sits on the UK R&D People and Culture Strategy Ministerial Coordination Group, QAA Advisory Committee on Degree Awarding Powers, and Technician Commitment Steering Board. CRAC manages the Vitae Programme in higher education, strengthening institutional provision for the professional development of researchers through research and innovation, training and resources, events, consultancy, and membership. Clare also served on EFMD's Doctoral Programmes Committee 2017–2019.

Foreword

Doctorates at business schools serve a variety of functions for society, academic disciplines, and the institutions that award the qualifications. The societal impact of Doctorates of Business Administration (DBA), other professional doctorates and PhDs has largely been neglected in the focus on providing business and management studies undergraduate degrees and programmes such as MBA. Yet, the future pipeline of academic faculty and highly qualified practising executives relies on a supply of business and management doctorates. Furthermore, holders of business doctorates are a source of research and new knowledge to inform practice as they shape the thinking, relevance and rigour of the most popular subject in universities globally – indeed, they are the custodians of their disciplines and creators of new knowledge that has a major that influence on our lives.

Business and Management Doctorates World-Wide: Developing the Next Generation by Nicola J. Palmer, Julie Davies, and Clare Viney offers valuable and differentiated insights and critical commentary on business school doctorates today. The authors seek to give an overview of the different types of business and management doctorate to present different models in the field. They draw upon a combined wealth of experience and acknowledging historical and contemporary influences. This volume skilfully engages with extensive published literature alongside experiential learning and navigates issues of structure and agency, highlighting tensions between the strategic purpose and value of the doctorate, barriers for under-represented groups, and effects on the research environment.

The authors draw attention to multiple stakeholder perspectives from business school educators, candidates and alumni, employers and policy makers to highlight the contributions to management scholarship and management practice of doctoral programmes in business schools.

As readers, we are encouraged to explore further the potential for alignment between businesses and better business and management doctoral experiences, graduate outcomes, links between industry and academia, and leading-edge creative practices. We are also challenged to broaden our own perspectives beyond familiarity with particular national systems to see the rich variety of doctorates.

In the following pages, you will find a comprehensive analysis of the current state of business and management doctorates not just on the European continent but around the globe. This complements the *EQUAL Guidelines for Doctoral Programmes in Business and Management* which present a common view of a doctorate in the field of business and management research, the largest in higher education. We are confident that doctoral education in management, whether PhD, DBA, professional, executive, and other doctorates provided by business schools offers tremendous opportunities to bridge theory and practice in an applied discipline. This is particularly salient in a world that continues to question the rigour and relevance of business school research. We congratulate the authors on highlighting important aspects of management education and supporting progress in this popular and dynamic field.

Professor Mark Smith

Director of the Stellenbosch Business School, Cape Town, South Africa Friedemann Schulze-Fielitz Director, EFMD Global Network Americas & Business School Services

Preface

In this book, we provide reflections on the purpose of business doctorates and international comparisons of innovations in doctoral education within different national educational systems and research and industrial strategies.

A great deal has been written about the MBA, undergraduate business education, and changing models of business schools themselves. With an increase in doctoral candidates world-wide, concerns have been expressed about their employment prospects and the oversupply of graduates in the management field. It would appear that although management is an applied discipline, even professional doctorates in management are decoupled from the growing research impact and interdisciplinary agendas.

To complement recent texts about professional doctorate supervision and perspectives on DBA students as scholar-practitioners, we draw attention more broadly to the purpose of doctoral education in business schools, programme design and management, and candidate experiences. The book draws on the authors' practical experiences, observations, and research on business school doctorates and the development of researchers.

We note the importance of perspective when examining doctoral education. Doctoral researchers and supervisors in business schools need to take a broader helicopter view of changes in management disciplines and business functions. Of course, the successful completion of business and management doctorates around the world requires hard work, courage, and thrift and the ability to analyse detailed evidence while seeing the big picture and making theoretical abstractions. There is a need to foreground individuals in the doctoral environment as persisting in the face of incoming challenges. Our book's front cover reflects these elements.

We hope that you find some useful and thought-provoking insights in this book. We look forward to continuing conversations about the value of business doctorates, re-imagining different models, ecosystems and interdisciplinary, cross-sector, and international collaborations.

> Nicola Palmer Yorkshire

> > Julie Davies London

Clare Viney Cambridge

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank especially JAS as well as:

Elena Braccia Nadine Burquel Karen Clegg Eva Cools Ann Davis Monique Donzel Martin Eley Vassili Joannidès de Lautour Eline Loux Yusra Mouzughi Mark Saunders Friedemann Schulze-Fielitz Mark Smith Howard Thomas Christine Unterhitzenberger Sofia Vala Matthew Wood

Nicola would like to acknowledge her family, the resilience of a tired and failing laptop and the unconditional love and patience of a spaniel who found his way home.

To quote T. S. Eliot, it's been 'such a long journey' since Nicola, Clare, and I first met in Grenoble and great fun collaborating with fellow travellers who believe that doctorates can transform lives. I also owe a huge debt of gratitude to my family.

I would like to thank Nicola and Julie for allowing me to tag along on this journey! When I first met them at the EFMD Conference in Grenoble, I naively thought that the culture and practice in Business Schools might help Vitae unlock the secrets to helping ALL researchers realise their potential. Consistently, around 80% of researchers aspire to an academic career with over 60% expecting to achieve this, though we know that while the numbers of researchers have continued to increase, there has been little or no growth in the availability of academic positions. Therefore, the career aspirations of most researchers are unrealistic compared to the probability of achieving a long-term academic career.

We are a small team that sits at the heart of a diverse community in over 20 countries. All of the CRAC-Vitae research has been conducted by Dr Robin Mellors-Bourne and Dr Janet Metcalfe, I thank them for their curiosity, thought-fulness, integrity, and passion.