

# **INTERDISCIPLINARY DIALOGUES ON ORGANIZATIONAL PARADOX**

Learning from Belief and Science,  
Part A

## **Edited by**

Rebecca Bednarek, Miguel Pina e Cunha,  
Jonathan Schad and Wendy K. Smith

RESEARCH IN THE  
SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

**PART 73A**

INTERDISCIPLINARY DIALOGUES  
ON ORGANIZATIONAL PARADOX

# RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

Series Editor: Michael Lounsbury

## Recent Volumes:

- Volume 47: The Structuring of Work in Organizations
- Volume 48A: How Institutions Matter!
- Volume 48B: How Institutions Matter!
- Volume 49: Multinational Corporations and Organization Theory: Post Millennium Perspectives
- Volume 50: Emergence
- Volume 51: Categories, Categorization and Categorizing: Category Studies in Sociology, Organizations and Strategy at the Crossroads
- Volume 52: Justification, Evaluation and Critique in the Study of Organizations: Contributions from French Pragmatist Sociology
- Volume 53: Structure, Content and Meaning of Organizational Networks: Extending Network Thinking
- Volume 54A: Multimodality, Meaning, and Institutions
- Volume 54B: Multimodality, Meaning, and Institutions
- Volume 55: Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
- Volume 56: Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
- Volume 57: Toward Permeable Boundaries of Organizations?
- Volume 58: Agents, Actors, Actorhood: Institutional Perspectives on the Nature of Agency, Action, and Authority
- Volume 59: The Production of Managerial Knowledge and Organizational Theory: New Approaches to Writing, Producing and Consuming Theory
- Volume 60: Race, Organizations, and the Organizing Process
- Volume 61: Routine Dynamics in Action
- Volume 62: Thinking Infrastructures
- Volume 63: The Contested Moralities of Markets
- Volume 64: Managing Inter-organizational Collaborations: Process Views
- Volume 65A: Microfoundations of Institutions
- Volume 65B: Microfoundations of Institutions
- Volume 66: Theorizing the Sharing Economy: Variety and Trajectories of New Forms of Organizing
- Volume 67: Tensions and Paradoxes in Temporary Organizing
- Volume 68: Macro Foundations: Exploring the Situated Nature of Activity
- Volume 69: Organizational Hybridity: Perspectives, Processes, Promises
- Volume 70: On Practice and Institution: Theorizing the Interface
- Volume 71: On Practice and Institution: New Empirical Directions
- Volume 72: Organizational Imaginaries: Tempering Capitalism and Tending to Communities through Cooperatives and Collectivist Democracy

# RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS ADVISORY BOARD

## Series Editor

Michael Lounsbury

Professor of Strategic Management & Organization

Canada Research Chair in Entrepreneurship & Innovation University of Alberta

School of Business

## RSO Advisory Board

Howard E. Aldrich, University of North Carolina, USA

Shaz Ansari, Cambridge University, UNITED KINGDOM

Silvia Dorado Banacloche, University of Massachusetts Boston, USA

Christine Beckman, University of Southern California, USA

Marya Besharov, Oxford University, UNITED KINGDOM

Eva Boxenbaum, Copenhagen Business School, DENMARK

Ed Carberry, University of Massachusetts Boston, USA

Lisa Cohen, McGill University, CANADA

Jeannette Colyvas, Northwestern University, USA

Erica Coslor, University of Melbourne, AUSTRALIA

Gerald F. Davis, University of Michigan, USA

Rich Dejordy, California State University, USA

Rodolphe Durand, HEC Paris, FRANCE

Fabrizio Ferraro, IESE Business School, SPAIN

Peer Fiss, University of Southern California, USA

Mary Ann Glynn, Boston College, USA

Nina Granqvist, Aalto University School of Business, FINLAND

Royston Greenwood, University of Alberta, CANADA

Stine Grodal, Northeastern University, USA

Markus A. Hoellerer, University of New South Wales, AUSTRALIA

Ruthanne Huising, emlyon business school, FRANCE

Candace Jones, University of Edinburgh, UNITED KINGDOM

Sarah Kaplan, University of Toronto, CANADA

Brayden G. King, Northwestern University, USA

Matthew S. Kraatz, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA

Tom Lawrence, Oxford University, UNITED KINGDOM

Xiaowei Rose Luo, Insead, FRANCE

Johanna Mair, Hertie School, GERMANY

Christopher Marquis, Cornell University, USA

Renate Meyer, Vienna University, AUSTRIA

William Ocasio, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA

Nelson Phillips, Imperial College London, UNITED KINGDOM

Prateek Raj, Indian Institute of Management Bangalore, INDIA

Marc Schneiberg, Reed College, USA

Marc-David Seidel, University of British Columbia, CANADA  
Paul Spee, University of Queensland, AUSTRALIA  
Paul Tracey, Cambridge University, UNITED KINGDOM  
Kerstin Sahlin, Uppsala University, SWEDEN  
Sarah Soule, Stanford University, USA  
Eero Vaara, University of Oxford, UNITED KINGDOM  
Marc Ventresca, University of Oxford, UNITED KINGDOM  
Maxim Voronov, York University, CANADA  
Filippo Carlo Wezel USI Lugano, SWITZERLAND  
Melissa Wooten, Rutgers University, USA  
April Wright, University of Queensland, AUSTRALIA  
Meng Zhao, Nanyang Business School & Renmin University, CHINA  
Enying Zheng, Peking University, CHINA  
Tammar B. Zilber, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, ISRAEL

RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF  
ORGANIZATIONS PART 73A

**INTERDISCIPLINARY  
DIALOGUES ON  
ORGANIZATIONAL  
PARADOX: LEARNING FROM  
BELIEF AND SCIENCE,  
PART A**

EDITED BY

**REBECCA BEDNAREK**

*Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand*

**MIGUEL PINA E CUNHA**

*Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Portugal*

**JONATHAN SCHAD**

*King's College London, UK*

AND

**WENDY K. SMITH**

*University of Delaware, USA*



United Kingdom – North America – Japan  
India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited  
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2021

Copyright © 2021 Emerald Publishing Limited

**Reprints and permissions service**

Contact: [permissions@emeraldinsight.com](mailto:permissions@emeraldinsight.com)

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

**British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-80117-184-7 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-80117-183-0 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-80043-410-3 (Epub)

ISSN: 0733-558X (Series)



ISOQAR certified  
Management System,  
awarded to Emerald  
for adherence to  
Environmental  
standard  
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985  
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

# CONTENTS

<i>About the Editors</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>About the Contributors</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Foreword</i>	<i>xxi</i>

## INTRODUCTION A

<b>The Value of Interdisciplinary Research to Advance Paradox in Organization Theory</b> <i>Rebecca Bednarek, Miguel Pina e Cunha, Jonathan Schad and Wendy Smith</i>	<i>3</i>
--	----------

## A1. REALM OF BELIEFS

<b>Paradox Beyond East/West Orthodoxy: The Case of Ubuntu</b> <i>Medhanie Gaim and Stewart Clegg</i>	<i>29</i>
<b>The Meta-perspective of Yin-Yang Balancing: Salient Implications for Organizational Management</b> <i>Peter Ping Li</i>	<i>51</i>
<b>Where We Might Least Expect to Find It: Organizing Paradoxes of Christian Theology in a Society of Organizations</b> <i>Mathew L. Sheep</i>	<i>75</i>
<b>Crossing Boundaries: Connecting Religion and Paradox for Leadership and Organization Research</b> <i>Ali Aslan Gümüşay</i>	<i>95</i>

<b>Commentary: Paradoxical Dimensions of Religious Experience</b> <i>Jean M. Bartunek and Mary Frohlich</i>	113
--	-----

## A2. REALM OF PHYSICAL SYSTEMS

<b>Paradox and Quantum Mechanics: Implications for the Management of Organizational Paradox from a Quantum Approach</b> <i>Eric Knight and Tobias Hahn</i>	129
---	-----

<b>Planetary Emergency and Paradox</b> <i>Amanda Williams, Katrin Heucher and Gail Whiteman</i>	151
--	-----

<b>Digitally Induced Industry Paradoxes: Disruptive Innovations of Taxiwork and Music Streaming Beyond Organizational Boundaries</b> <i>David Tilson, Carsten Sørensen and Kalle Lyytinen</i>	171
--	-----

<b>Commentary: Strategies for Studying How Contradictions Unfold</b> <i>Andrew H. Van de Ven</i>	193
---	-----

<i>Index</i>	203
--------------	-----

## ABOUT THE EDITORS

**Rebecca Bednarek** is an Associate Professor at Victoria University of Wellington. She studies paradoxes and strategizing practices and has written extensively about qualitative methods. She has co-authored a research-monograph “*Making a Market for Acts of God*” published by Oxford University Press.

**Miguel Pina e Cunha** is the Fundação Amélia de Mello Professor of Leadership and Organization at Nova School of Business and Economics, Universidade Nova de Lisboa (Portugal). He studies organizational as process and paradox. He recently coauthored Elgar Introduction to Organizational Paradox Theory (Edward Elgar) and Paradoxes of Power and Leadership (Routledge).

**Jonathan Schad** is an Assistant Professor (‘Lecturer’) in Strategy and Organisation Theory at King’s College London, UK and an Academic Fellow of the University of Geneva, Switzerland. His research uses paradox theory to better understand the fundamental tensions contemporary organizations confront.

**Wendy K. Smith** is Professor and Deutsch Family Fellow at University of Delaware, USA. She explores how leaders navigate strategic paradoxes, such as tensions between exploration and exploitation or social missions and financial demands. Wendy co-edited the *Oxford Handbook of Organizational Paradox*. She is recognized by the Web of Science for being among the top 1% of most cited scholars in 2019 and 2020.

*This page intentionally left blank*

# ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

**Jean M. Bartunek** holds the Ferris Chair and is a Professor of Management and Organization at Boston College, USA. She is a past President of the Academy of Management and past Dean of the Fellows of the Academy of Management. Her scholarly interests concern organizational change and academic–practitioner relationships.

**Stewart Clegg**, recently retired from the University of Stavanger Business School, Norway and Nova School of Business and Economics, is recognized in several fields in the social sciences for his work in organization studies and on power. He is a Prolific Writer and Contributor to journals and has also produced a large number of books, gaining several awards of note.

**Mary Frohlich** is a Professor of Spirituality at the Catholic Theological Union, USA. She is a past President of the Society for the Study of Christian Spirituality and is a noted scholar of Carmelite spirituality. Her research interests include contributions of the physical and human sciences to insight into spiritual transformation.

**Medhanie Gaim** is an Associate Professor of Management at Umeå School of Business, Economics, and Statistics, Sweden. His research focuses predominantly on paradox theory and on entrepreneurial ecosystems and new venture creation. His research has been published in journals such as *Academy of Management Review*, *Organization Studies*, and *Research in the Sociology of Organizations*.

**Ali Aslan Gümüşay** is a Senior Researcher at Universität Hamburg and Head of Research Group at the Humboldt Institute for Internet & Society. He works on values, meaning, and hybridity in entrepreneurial settings; grand challenges, innovation, and new forms of organizing; societal complexity and engaged scholarship; and digitalization, AI, and leadership.

**Tobias Hahn** is a Professor of Sustainability at Esade Business School in Barcelona, Spain. He has published on paradoxes and tensions in sustainability, sustainability strategies, stakeholder behavior, and sustainable performance assessment. His research has appeared in journals such as *Academy of Management Review*, *Organization Studies*, *Journal of Business Ethics*, and *Business & Society*.

**Katrin Heucher** is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Erb Institute, University of Michigan. She received her PhD from Loughborough University, UK. Her research lies at the intersection of sustainability management and organization studies. She uses qualitative methods such as organizational ethnography to study processes around corporate sustainability and paradox.

**Eric Knight** is Executive Dean and a Professor of Strategic Management at Macquarie Business School, Macquarie University, Australia. He has published on paradoxes and organizational strategy, with a particular interest in a social practices approach. His research has appeared in journals such as *Academy of Management Review*, *Strategic Management Journal*, *Organization Studies*, and *Human Relations*.

**Kalle Lyytinen** is a Distinguished University Professor and Iris S. Wolstein Professor of Management Design at Case Western Reserve University, and a Distinguished Visiting Professor at Aalto University, Finland (Industrial and Engineering Management). He is among the top five IS scholars in terms of his h-index (92). He has published over 400 refereed articles and edited or written over 30 books or special issues.

**Peter Ping Li** is Li Dak Sum Chair Professor of International Business at the University of Nottingham at Ningbo, China, and Professor of Chinese Business Studies at Copenhagen Business School, Denmark. As a thought leader about indigenous management and emerging multinationals, his primary research focuses on building geocentric (West-meeting-East) theories.

**Mathew L. Sheep** is an Associate Dean in the Lutgert College of Business. His research focuses on discursive perspectives of paradox and identity. He served as Associate Editor for *Human Relations* 2012–2019 and continues to serve on its Editorial Board.

**Carsten Sørensen** is a Reader (Associate Professor) in Digital Innovation at The London School of Economics and Political Science's Department of Management. He has published in all the major Information Systems journals, managed large research grants, and consulted enterprises on issues related to the digital transformation of business.

**David Tilson** is a Clinical Professor of Information Systems and Analytics at the University of Rochester's Simon Business School. His research primarily explores digital infrastructures and platforms. In other research streams he has explored technical standards, mobile computing, and improving operational efficiency in healthcare settings.

**Andrew H. Van de Ven** is a Professor Emeritus in the Carlson School of the University of Minnesota. His research has dealt with the Nominal Group Technique, organization design and assessment, inter-organizational relationships, organizational innovation, change and paradox, and engaged scholarship research methods. During 2000–2001 he was President of the Academy of Management, and he was Founding Editor of *Academy of Management Discoveries* (2012–2017).

**Gail Whiteman** is a Professor-in-Residence at the World Business Council for Sustainable Development and Professor of Sustainability at the University of

Exeter Business School, UK. Her research analyzes how actors make sense of complex problems and build resilience across scales. She is the Founder of Arctic Basecamp, a science-solutions communication platform at the World Economic Forum.

**Amanda Williams** is a Senior Researcher at ETH Zurich, Switzerland in the Group for Sustainability and Technology. She received her PhD from Rotterdam School of Management, the Netherlands. Her research focuses on corporate sustainability, social-ecological systems, and resilience.

*This page intentionally left blank*

# LIST OF FIGURES

Chapter 1	Fig. 1.1.	The Interrelated Features of Ubuntu.	38
Chapter 2	Fig. 2.1.	The Structures of Yin-Yang Balancing with Black, White and Gray Areas.	63
	Fig. 2.2.	The Holistic and Dynamic Process of Yin-Yang Balancing with the Stages and Thresholds at Multiple Levels for Structural Changes.	65
Chapter 4	Fig. 4.1.	Expanding Outer Boundaries.	101
	Fig. 4.2.	Dynamizing Inner Boundaries.	105
	Fig. 4.3.	Shifting Boundaries.	106
Chapter 6	Fig. 6.1.	The Planetary Boundaries Framework.	154
	Fig. 6.2a.	Nested Systems Perspective of the Planetary Emergency with Inherent Paradoxes Across Economic, Social, and Environmental Dimensions.	158
	Fig. 6.2b.	Salient Shock Related to the Planetary Emergency with Latent Issues in the Background.	160
	Fig. 6.2c.	A Series of Shocks Related to the Planetary Emergency Over Time.	161
	Fig. 6.3.	A Framework for Navigating Paradoxical Tensions under Planetary <i>Emergency Conditions</i> .	163
Commentary 2	Fig. C2.1.	Approaches to Managing Contradiction.	197

*This page intentionally left blank*

# LIST OF TABLES

Introduction	Table I.1.	The Realm of Belief to Inform Paradox Theory.	11
	Table I.2.	The Realm of Physical Systems to Inform Paradox Theory.	13
	Table I.3.	The Realm of Social Structures to Inform Paradox Theory.	15
	Table I.4.	The Realm of Expression to Inform Paradox Theory.	17
Chapter 1	Table 1.1.	Key Features and Differences in Approach.	40
Chapter 2	Table 2.1.	The Similarities and Distinctions Between Three Core Epistemological Systems.	58
	Table 2.2.	The Three Systems for Paradox Management with Selected Illustrations.	59
Commentary 1	Table C1.1.	Treatments of Religion-related Paradox.	121
Chapter 5	Table 5.1.	Different Management Approaches to Organizational Paradox.	145

*This page intentionally left blank*

# LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Jean M. Bartunek	<i>Boston College, USA</i>
Rebecca Bednarek	<i>Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand</i>
Stewart Clegg	<i>University of Stavanger, Norway and Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Portugal</i>
Mary Frohlich	<i>Catholic Theological Union, USA</i>
Medhanie Gaim	<i>Umeå University, Sweden</i>
Ali Aslan Gümüşay	<i>Universität Hamburg, Germany</i>
Tobias Hahn	<i>Universitat Ramon Llull, Esade Business School, Spain</i>
Katrin Heucher	<i>University of Michigan, USA</i>
Eric Knight	<i>Macquarie University, Australia</i>
Kalle Lyytinen	<i>Case Western Reserve University, USA</i>
Miguel Pina e Cunha	<i>Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Portugal</i>
Peter Ping Li	<i>University of Nottingham at Ningbo, China</i>
Jonathan Schad	<i>King's College London, UK</i>
Mathew L. Sheep	<i>Florida Gulf Coast University USA</i>
Wendy Smith	<i>University of Delaware, USA</i>
Carsten Sørensen	<i>London School of Economics and Political Science, UK</i>
David Tilson	<i>University of Rochester, USA</i>
Andrew H. Van de Ven	<i>University of Minnesota, USA</i>
Gail Whiteman	<i>University of Exeter, UK</i>
Amanda Williams	<i>ETH Zurich, Switzerland</i>

*This page intentionally left blank*

# FOREWORD

*Research in the Sociology of Organizations (RSO)* publishes cutting edge empirical research and theoretical papers that seek to enhance our understanding of organizations and organizing as pervasive and fundamental aspects of society and economy. We seek provocative papers that push the frontiers of current conversations, that help to revive old ones, or that incubate and develop new perspectives. Given its successes in this regard, RSO has become an impactful and indispensable fount of knowledge for scholars interested in organizational phenomena and theories. RSO is indexed and ranks highly in Scopus/SCImago as well as in the Academic Journal Guide published by the Chartered Association of Business schools.

As one of the most vibrant areas in the social sciences, the sociology of organizations engages a plurality of empirical and theoretical approaches to enhance our understanding of the varied imperatives and challenges that these organizations and their organizers face. Of course, there is a diversity of formal and informal organizations – from for-profit entities to non-profits, state and public agencies, social enterprises, communal forms of organizing, non-governmental associations, trade associations, publicly traded, family owned and managed, private firms – the list goes on! Organizations, moreover, can vary dramatically in size from small entrepreneurial ventures to large multinational conglomerates to international governing bodies such as the United Nations.

Empirical topics addressed by *RSO* include: the formation, survival, and growth of organizations; collaboration and competition between organizations; the accumulation and management of resources and legitimacy; and how organizations or organizing efforts cope with a multitude of internal and external challenges and pressures. Particular interest is growing in the complexities of contemporary organizations as they cope with changing social expectations and as they seek to address societal problems related to corporate social responsibility, inequality, corruption and wrongdoing, and the challenge of new technologies. As a result, levels of analysis reach from the individual, to the organization, industry, community and field, and even the nation-state or world society. Much research is multilevel and embraces both qualitative and quantitative forms of data.

Diverse theory is employed or constructed to enhance our understanding of these topics. While anchored in the discipline of sociology and the field of management, *RSO* also welcomes theoretical engagement that draws on other disciplinary conversations – such as those in political science or economics, as well as work from diverse philosophical traditions. *RSO* scholarship has helped push forward a plethora theoretical conversations on institutions and institutional change, networks, practice, culture, power, inequality, social movements, categories, routines, organization design and change, configurational dynamics and many other topics.

Each volume of *RSO* tends to be thematically focused on a particular empirical phenomenon (e.g., creative industries, multinational corporations, entrepreneurship) or theoretical conversation (e.g., institutional logics, actors and agency, and microfoundations). The series publishes papers by junior as well as leading international scholars, and embraces diversity on all dimensions. If you are scholar interested in organizations or organizing, I hope you find *RSO* to be an invaluable resource as you develop your work.

Professor Michael Lounsbury  
Series Editor, *Research in the Sociology of Organizations*  
Canada Research Chair in Entrepreneurship & Innovation  
University of Alberta