



CRITICAL MANAGEMENT STUDIES

**AN ANTi-HISTORY
ABOUT
TRANSGENDER
INCLUSION IN
THE BRAZILIAN
LABOR MARKET**

**CAMILLA PINTO LUNA
DENISE FRANCA BARROS**

An ANTi-History about Transgender Inclusion in the Brazilian Labor Market

CRITICAL MANAGEMENT STUDIES

The *Critical Management Studies* series covers topics from management style techniques, corporate culture and cross-cultural management to evaluation, organizational structure and management science and operations, drawing on a range of radical traditions that include feminism, critical theory, Marxism, post-modernism/poststructuralism, critical race theory, environmentalism, labor process theory, postcolonial theory, existentialism, and applied critical management studies.

Books in this series aim to contribute to sociopolitical change, from authors who self-identify as critical management scholars, critical scholars of management, or those with practical experience in the field, encouraging us to rethink the fundamental relationships between working/organizing/managing and our sense of humanity.

Previous books:

Organizing Disaster: The Construction of Humanitarianism

Written by: Adam Rostis

Organization Theory: Critical and Philosophical Engagements

Written by: Tuomo Peltonen

Contesting Institutional Hegemony in Today's Business Schools: Doctoral Students Speak Out

Edited by: Ajnesh Prasad

The Ideological Evolution of Human Resource Management: A Critical Look into HRM Research and Practices

Written by: Sami Itani

Making Critical Sense of Immigrant Experience: A Case Study of Hong Kong Chinese in Canada

Written by: Rosalie K.S. Hilde

STEM-Professional Women's Exclusion in the Canadian Space Industry: Anchor Points and Intersectionality at the Margins of Space

Written by: Stefanie Ruel

Values, Rationality, and Power: Developing Organizational Wisdom: A Case Study of a Canadian Healthcare Authority

Written by: Brad C. Anderson

Historical Female Management Theorists: Frances Perkins, Hallie Flanagan, Madeleine Parent, Viola Desmond

Written by: Kristin S. Williams

An ANTi-History about Transgender Inclusion in the Brazilian Labor Market

BY

CAMILLA PINTO LUNA

University of Grande Rio, Brazil

AND

DENISE FRANCA BARROS

University of Grande Rio, Brazil



United Kingdom – North America – Japan – India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2023

Copyright © 2023 Camilla Pinto Luna and Denise Franca Barros.
Published under exclusive license by Emerald Publishing Limited.

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: permissions@emeraldinsight.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-83753-153-0 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-83753-152-3 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-83753-154-7 (Epub)



ISOQAR certified
Management System,
awarded to Emerald
for adherence to
Environmental
standard
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

Contents

List of Figures and Tables	<i>vii</i>
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	<i>ix</i>
About the Authors	<i>xiii</i>
Preface	<i>xv</i>
Acknowledgements	<i>xvii</i>
Abstract	<i>xviii</i>
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
Research Relevance and Contributions	6
Research Delimitation	8
Chapter 2 Violence and Resistance: Understanding Issues Situated (Not Limited) to Brazil	11
Chapter 3 A Discussion about Performativity, Transsexuality, and Organizations	21
Gender Performativity	21
Transsexuality	23
Transsexuality, Prejudice, Exclusion, and Organizations	24
Institutionalized Transphobia	27
Performativity, ANTi-History, and Gender	31
Chapter 4 The ANTi-History as Theoretical Lens and Methodological Approach	35
Historical Turn in Organizational Studies: The Origin of the Call	35
ANTi-History as Theoretical Lens	37
ANTi-History as Methodological Approach	40

Procedures for Data Collection	43
Preparation of Network Diagrams	50
Chapter 5 ANTi-History and Rhizome: Unveiling a Socio Past in Layers	53
Chapter 6 The Beginning of this Version: The Trans Body as a Material Property Conserved by the Brazilian State	57
Chapter 7 Toward the Guarantee of Fundamental Rights: Sociopolitical (Trans)Formations in Brazil	63
Chapter 8 (Re)Assembling a Normative Course: Right to Health, Depathologization of Transsexuality and Recognition of “Employable People”	73
Chapter 9 Mobilizations and Demobilizations of Trans Employability in Motion	87
Chapter 10 The End of this Version: Layers of a Rhizome Network	95
Reassembling a Recent Past: Diversity Policies in Organizations	97
Chapter 11 Final Considerations	105
Implications Research and ESG	107
Conclusion	109
Epilogue: Ongoing and Future Research	109
 Appendix 1: List of Data Sources	 111
Appendix 2: Data Collected in the Transempregos Vacancies Bank	125
References	177
Index	193

List of Figures and Tables

Figures

Fig. 1.	Diagram of the Socio Past (Re)Assembly Process.	43
Fig. 2.	Organization and Storage of Research Collection.	47
Fig. 3.	Network Rhizome Diagram (First Layer).	60
Fig. 4.	Network Rhizome Diagram (Second Layer).	71
Fig. 5.	Network Rhizome Diagram (Third Layer).	86
Fig. 6.	Network Rhizome Diagram (Fourth Layer).	94
Fig. 7.	Network Rhizome Diagram with Overlapping Layers.	97
Fig. 8.	Trans Employability Map in Brazil.	100
Fig. 9.	Distribution Graph of Job Offers by State.	101

Tables

Table 1.	Data Collection Strategies.	44
Table 2.	Strategy A: Purpose, Procedures, and Collection.	45
Table 3.	Strategy B: Purpose, Procedures, and Collection.	48
Table 4.	Strategy C: Purpose, Procedures, and Collection.	49

This page intentionally left blank

List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

ABGLT	Associação Brasileira de Gays, Bissexuais, Lésbicas, Travestis e Transexuais [Brazilian Association of Gays, Bisexuals, Lesbians, Transvestites and Transsexuals]
ABHT	Associação Brasileira de Homens Trans [Brazilian Association of Trans Men]
ABRAT	Associação Brasileira de Transgêneros [Brazilian Transgender Association]
AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ANT	Actor-Network Theory
ANTRA	Associação Nacional de Travestis e Transexuais [National Association of Transvestites and Transsexuals]
ASTRAL	Associação das Travestis e Liberados [Association of Transvestites and Liberated]
ATRAS	Associação das Travestis de Salvador [Salvador Transvestites Association]
BBC	British Broadcasting Corporation
CCJ	Comissão de Constituição de Justiça [Justice Constitution Commission]
CEP	Comitês de Ética em Pesquisa [Research Ethics Committees]
CFM	Conselho Federal de Medicina [Federal Council of Medicine]
CIT	Comissão Intergestores Tripartite [Tripartite Interagency Committee]
CLAM	Centro Latino-Americano em Sexualidade e Direitos Humanos [Latin American Center on Sexuality and Human Rights]
CMS	Critical Management Studies
CNS	Conferência Nacional de Saúde [National Health Conference]

CONEP	Comissão Nacional de Ética em Pesquisa [National Research Ethics Commission]
CONITEC	Comissão Nacional de Incorporação de Tecnologias no SUS [National Commission for the Incorporation of Technologies in SUS]
COVID-19	Coronavirus Disease 2019
CREMESP	Conselho Regional de Medicina do Estado de São Paulo [Regional Council of Medicine of the State of São Paulo]
CRM-MG	Conselho Regional de Medicina – Minas Gerais [Regional Council of Medicine – Minas Gerais]
CRM-PR	Conselho Regional de Medicina – Paraná [Regional Council of Medicine – Paraná]
CRM-SC	Conselho Regional de Medicina – Santa Catarina [Regional Council of Medicine – Santa Catarina]
CRM-SP	Conselho Regional de Medicina – São Paulo [Regional Council of Medicine – São Paulo]
DEGRAN	Departamento das Delegacias Regionais de Polícia da Grande São Paulo [Department of Regional Police Stations of Greater São Paulo]
ENCM	Encontro Nacional dos Conselhos de Medicina [National Meeting of Medical Councils]
ENTLAIDS	Encontro Nacional de Travestis e Liberados que Atuam na Prevenção da Aids [National Meeting of Transvestites and Liberals who Work in the Prevention of AIDS]
ESG	Environmental, Social, and Corporate Governance
FMUSP	Hospital de Clínicas da Faculdade de Medicina [Clinical Hospital of the Faculty of Medicine]
FONATRANS	Fórum Nacional de Travestis e Transexuais Negras e Negros [National Forum of Black and Black Transvestites and Transsexuals]
FPE	Frente Parlamentar Evangélica [Evangelical Parliamentary Front of the Brazilian National Congress]
FURG	Universidade Federal do Espírito Santo [Federal University of Espírito Santo]
GABLE	Gay, Ally, Bisexual, Lesbian and Transgender Employees (Procter & Gamble)
GGB	Grupo Gay da Bahia [Bahia Gay Group]
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
HUPE	Hospital Universitário Pedro Ernesto [Pedro Ernesto University Hospital]

IACHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IBGE	Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística [Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics]
IBRAT	Instituto Brasileiro de Transmasculinidades [Brazilian Institute of Transmasculinities]
IBTE	Instituto Brasileiro Trans de Educação [Trans Brazilian Institute of Education]
ICD	International Classification of Diseases
ILGA WORLD	The International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Association
IMS	Instituto de Medicina Social [Institute of Social Medicine]
ISER	Instituto Superior de Estudos da Religião [Higher Institute of Religious Studies]
LGBTQIA+	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transsexual/Transgender, Queer, Intersexual, Asexual, all other diversities and pluralities of sexual orientation or gender identity that exist
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MECMPAS	Instituto de Psiquiatria da Fundação Faculdade de Medicina [Psychiatry Institute of Faculty-Foundation of Medicine]
MOS	Management and Organizational Studies
MPDFT	Ministério Público do Distrito Federal [Federal District Public Ministry]
MPF	Ministério Público Federal [Federal Public Ministry]
MPSP	Ministério Público do Estado de São Paulo [Public Ministry of the State of São Paulo]
NAHT	Núcleo de Apoio a Homens Trans [Support Center for Trans Men]
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OAB	Ordem dos Advogados do Brasil [Brazilian Bar Association]
OMS	Organizational Memory Studies
PUC-Rio	Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro [Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro]
PUC-SP	Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo [Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo]
RENATA	Rede Nacional de Travestis [National Transvestite Network]
RENTAL	Rede Nacional de Travestis e Liberados [National Network of Transvestites and Liberated People]

SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
SEJUR/CFM	Setor Jurídico do Conselho Federal de Medicina [Legal Sector of the Federal Council of Medicine]
SINAN	Sistema de Informação de Agravos de Notificação [Notification Grievances Information System]
SOGIE	Sexual Orientation or Gender Identity and Expression
STD	Sexually Transmitted Diseases
STF	Supremo Tribunal Federal [Federal Court of Justice]
SUDS	Sistemas Unificados e Descentralizados de Saúde nos Estados [Unified and Decentralized Health Systems in the States]
SUS	Sistema Único de Saúde [Health Unic System]
TGEU	Transgender Europe
TJSP	Tribunal de Justiça do Estado de São Paulo [Court of Justice of the State of São Paulo]
TMM	Trans Murder Monitoring
TRF	Tribunal Regional Federal [Federal Regional Court]
UERJ	Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro [State University of Rio de Janeiro]
UFES	Universidade Federal do Espírito Santo [Federal University of Espírito Santo]
UFG	Universidade Federal de Goiás [Goiás Federal University]
UFMG	Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais [Minas Gerais Federal University]
UFRGS	Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul [Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul]
UNIDAS	Associação de Travestis Unidas na Luta pela Cidadania [Association of Transvestites United in the Fight for Citizenship]
USP	Universidade de São Paulo [University of Sao Paulo]
WHO	World Health Organization

About the Authors

Camilla Pinto Luna holds a Ph.D. in Management (2021), Master in Management (2017) from the University of Grande Rio (PPGA – UNIGRANRIO), and Specialist in Public Administration by IAVM, Cândido Mendes University (2011). Luna graduated in Business from the State University of Rio de Janeiro – UERJ (2009); is Administrator at the Federal University of the State of Rio de Janeiro (UNIRIO); and is member of two research groups at UNIGRANRIO, a group focused on studies of gender, sexuality, work, and consumption and another group on critical studies in organizational studies. Luna's research interest is in organizational studies, historical approaches in management, and gender studies.

Denise Franca Barros holds a Ph.D. in Management (2011) and a Master in Public Administration and Management (2006) from EBAPE-FGV, Rio de Janeiro). Barros previously worked at Unigranrio – University of Grande Rio, Fundação Getulio Vargas (EBAPE-FGV, Rio de Janeiro) and Escola Superior de Propaganda e Marketing (ESPM – Rio).

This page intentionally left blank

Preface

It is not news that we discuss issues about power relations in discourse, reflecting on which voices have space for speech and which are marginalized and often silenced (seeing the works of Bourdieu, Foucault, and Butler). However, it seems that the expression *place of speech* has become popular here in Brazil very recently, and, despite being present in several discussions, many people still do not understand for sure what it is. At least, this is my experience in forums, meetings, conferences, and conversations with colleagues and friends. Some people can explain the topic in greater depth, such as Djamila Ribeiro – Brazilian, feminist, philosopher, writer (I even recommend this source to anyone who wants to understand the place of speech better). However, briefly, I would say that when we talk about the place of speech, we are arguing about social issues that impact different spaces and organizations (whether political, cultural, or intellectual) and that limit and make individualized aspects of the experiences invisible because some of these voices were silenced since individuals were excluded from these spaces.

But why am I talking about this?

Because many of you are reading this work, upon seeing the title, you must have wondered if I am a trans woman (by the way, answering the question, I am not).

Then, other questions will probably arise (Why did you choose to talk about this topic? How did you get to it? Can you talk about it? Do you want to speak in place of a trans?).

I am uncomfortable with a reality where people do not have the same opportunities or possibilities. So why wouldn't I stay?! Looking around and seeing that certain problems belong to everyone is very important for us to start thinking about solutions. Using the words of Professor Luiz Alex Saraiva (2016):

[...] we live in dangerous blindness to everything that does not affect us personally. Only when this unspeakable violence comes close to we know does it seem to concern us. We lose empathy, the ability to put ourselves in the other's shoes to see the suffering of others as somehow close to ourselves for the sake of humanity. (p. 762)

All this to be able to say that I feel uncomfortable with social exclusion – for me, my history, and others. Once again, quoting the words of Professor Luiz Alex, in a free translation from the original:

I am with all those who fight for a collective cause, who do not hide under corrosive individualism. I deeply regret the victims of an order that denies difference. (Saraiva, 2016, p. 772)

My perception of the possibilities of management and organizations goes beyond something that only occurs within corporations, and it is not new that I am interested in researching gender issues (a theme I have been working on for years). The relationship between the management area and society is clear to me, added to an experience that is part of the nature of exclusion.

Today, as an administrator and researcher in Administration, I have a place where I can talk about certain aspects, but I recognize that many others are not within my competence. Therefore, it is important to clarify that I do not intend to speak for a transgender person. I do not want to try to convey the perspective or experience of a transgender person. I do not occupy this place of speech. But I want to make other researchers in Administration, future managers, or current managers reflect on this issue. I want to address the different forms of social exclusion, gender identity prejudice, inequality, and role inclusion policies, citizenship, and guaranteed access to education, leisure, health, and work.

So, for this reason, I chose to bring to this book an important social issue that is still silent in the area. I did that seeking to draw attention to the problem and a change, however small it is. Furthermore, if your biggest question when reading the title of this work was: *Is the author trans?* – it might be very interesting that you keep reading the content and try to understand how this is everyone's problem.

Camilla Pinto Luna

Acknowledgements

First, we would like to thank Gabrielle Durepos for being part of our path, for the encouragement for this project, and all the generosity. Gabie, you inspired us and this is something beyond words.

We thank the editorial team and the reviewers for your kind attention and suggestions, which we believe were crucial for improving our work.

We would also like to thank the Emerald team for seriousness and commitment to work. Especially, Albert Mills for kindness and for all the guidelines. As well as Fiona Allison for the promptness and feedback.

Finally, we want to thank all those researchers and colleagues who contributed throughout our trajectory, even whose names were not mentioned here.

Abstract

Brazil is a country with the highest rate of trans people murders and a scenario where most of these people are in conditions of misery and social exclusion, without access to health, education, and labor. Recently, we observed a movement of organizations seeking to promote the employability of transgender people in the country. This scenario is not built from isolated events that occur today, but it reflects relationships that were built over time. This past is full of events that can be considered advances and setbacks arising from associations between people, initiatives, regulations, organizations, and other actors that intervene in this regard. Thereby, this study seeks to investigate sociopolitical relations of actors-network highlighting the main mobilizations and demobilizations in the trajectory of employability of transgender people in organizations in Brazil. For this, we resorted to ANTi-History as a theoretical and methodological approach, which is historically informed by the Actor-Network Theory and was developed in Management and Organization Studies in order to allow us to understand the phenomenon through a unique and retrospective lens. The analysis of this research (re)assembles a version of history about the observed phenomenon and brings a network rhizome that involves a multiplicity of actors and their relations over time. This implies rescuing memories in the transgender–society–labor market relationship, as well as revealing a broader context that surrounds recent employability initiatives and silencing around this matter.

Keywords: ANTi-History; transgender; organizations; employability; work; Transphobia