

# THE PRODUCTION OF MANAGERIAL KNOWLEDGE AND ORGANIZATIONAL THEORY

**Edited by** Tammar B. Zilber, John M. Amis,  
and Johanna Mair

Sponsored by the  
ASA section on Organizations,  
Occupations and Work

RESEARCH IN THE  
SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

**VOLUME 59**

THE PRODUCTION OF  
MANAGERIAL KNOWLEDGE  
AND ORGANIZATIONAL THEORY

# RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

Series Editor: Michael Lounsbury

- Volume 38: Configurational Theory and Methods in Organizational Research
- Volume 39A: Institutional Logics in Action, Part A
- Volume 39B: Institutional Logics in Action, Part B
- Volume 40: Contemporary Perspectives on Organizational Social Networks
- Volume 41: Religion and Organization Theory
- Volume 42: Organizational Transformation and Scientific Change: The Impact of Institutional Restructuring on Universities and Intellectual Innovation
- Volume 43: Elites on Trial
- Volume 44: Institutions and Ideals: Philip Selznick's Legacy for Organizational Studies
- Volume 45: Towards a Comparative Institutionalism: Forms, Dynamics and Logics Across the Organizational Fields of Health and Higher Education
- Volume 46: The University Under Pressure
- Volume 47: The Structuring of Work in Organizations
- Volume 48A: How Institutions Matter!
- Volume 48B: How Institutions Matter!
- Volume 49: Multinational Corporations and Organization Theory: Post Millennium Perspectives
- Volume 50: Emergence
- Volume 51: Categories, Categorization and Categorizing: Category Studies in Sociology, Organizations and Strategy at the Crossroads
- Volume 52: Justification, Evaluation and Critique in the Study of Organizations: Contributions from French Pragmatist Sociology
- Volume 53: Structure, Content and Meaning of Organizational Networks: Extending Network Thinking
- Volume 54A: Multimodality, Meaning, and Institutions
- Volume 54B: Multimodality, Meaning, and Institutions
- Volume 55: Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
- Volume 56: Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
- Volume 57: Towards Permeable Boundaries of Organizations?
- Volume 58: Agents, Actors, Actorhood: Institutional Perspectives on the Nature of Agency, Action, and Authority

RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF  
ORGANIZATIONS, VOL 59

**THE PRODUCTION  
OF MANAGERIAL  
KNOWLEDGE AND  
ORGANIZATIONAL THEORY:  
NEW APPROACHES TO  
WRITING, PRODUCING AND  
CONSUMING THEORY**

EDITED BY

**TAMMAR B. ZILBER**

*Hebrew University, Israel*

**JOHN M. AMIS**

*University of Edinburgh, UK*

**JOHANNA MAIR**

*Hertie School of Governance, Germany*



United Kingdom – North America – Japan  
India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited  
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2019

Copyright © 2019 Emerald Publishing Limited

**Reprints and permissions service**

Contact: [permissions@emeraldinsight.com](mailto:permissions@emeraldinsight.com)

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

**British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-78769-184-1 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-78769-183-4 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-78769-185-8 (Epub)

ISSN: 0733-558X (Series)



ISOQAR certified  
Management System,  
awarded to Emerald  
for adherence to  
Environmental  
standard  
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985  
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

# CONTENTS

<i>List of Contributors</i>	vii
<i>About the Editors</i>	xiii
<b>Introduction Dismantling the Master's House Using the Master's Tools: On the Sociology of Organizational Knowledge</b> <i>Tammar B. Zilber, John M. Amis and Johanna Mair</i>	1
<b>Chapter 1 The Problem of De-contextualization in Organization and Management Research</b> <i>Gregory Jackson, Markus Helfen, Rami Kaplan, Anja Kirsch and Nora Lohmeyer</i>	21
<b>Chapter 2 Pragmatism in Organizations: Ambivalence and Limits</b> <i>Wolfgang Seibel</i>	43
<b>Chapter 3 Reframing Rigor as Reasoning: Challenging Technocratic Conceptions of Rigor in Management Research</b> <i>Bill Harley and Joep Cornelissen</i>	59
<b>Chapter 4 Knowledge Production and Consumption in the Digital Era: The Emergence of Altmetrics and Open Access Publishing in Management Studies</b> <i>Trin Thananusak and Shaz Ansari</i>	77
<b>Chapter 5 Peer Review and the Production of Scholarly Knowledge: Automated Textual Analysis of Manuscripts Revised for Publication in <i>Administrative Science Quarterly</i></b> <i>David Strang and Fedor Dokshin</i>	103
<b>Chapter 6 The (Re?)Emergence of New Ideas in the Field of Organizational Studies</b> <i>Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist</i>	123
<b>Chapter 7 A Discourse Perspective on Creating Organizational Knowledge: The Case of Strategizing</b> <i>Maurizio Floris, David Grant and Cliff Oswick</i>	141

<b>Chapter 8 When Fieldwork Hurts: On the Lived Experience of Conducting Research in Unsettling Contexts</b> <i>Laura Claus, Mark de Rond, Jennifer Howard-Grenville and Jan Lodge</i>	157
<b>Chapter 9 Visual Artefacts as Tools for Analysis and Theorizing</b> <i>Ann Langley and Davide Ravasi</i>	173
<b>Chapter 10 Presenting Findings from Qualitative Research: One Size Does Not Fit All!</b> <i>Trish Reay, Asma Zafar, Pedro Monteiro and Vern Glaser</i>	201
<b>Chapter 11 For Social Reflexivity in Organization and Management Theory</b> <i>Chris Carter and Crawford Spence</i>	217
<b>Chapter 12 ‘Through the Looking Glass’: on Phantasmal Tales, Distortions and Reflexivity in Organizational Scholarship</b> <i>Barbara Gray</i>	237
<b>Chapter 13 When Research and Personal Lifeworlds Collide</b> <i>April L. Wright and Carla Wright</i>	255
Index	275

# LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

**Shaz Ansari** is Professor at Judge Business School, University of Cambridge, UK. He has published in *Academy of Management Journal*, *Academy of Management Review*, *Strategic Management Journal*, *Organization Science*, *Journal of Management Studies*, *Research Policy and Organization Studies*. He serves on editorial boards of *AMJ*, *AMR*, *Organization Science*, *JOM*, *JMS* and *Organization Studies*.

**Chris Carter** writes and teaches about politics, media and professional groups. He works at the University of Edinburgh, UK.

**Laura Claus** is Assistant Professor of Strategy & Entrepreneurship at University College London, School of Management, UK. Her research uses qualitative methods to study different organizational approaches to introducing change in the Global South. In so doing, she explores how organization can design and structure ‘solutions’ for deep-rooted social problems and support marginalized groups who lack the opportunity/voice to speak for themselves (e.g., child brides in Indonesia and rural villagers in Tanzania).

**Joep Cornelissen** is Professor of Corporate Communication and Management at Rotterdam School of Management, Erasmus University, The Netherlands. The main focus of his research involves studies of the role of corporate and managerial communication in the context of innovation, entrepreneurship and change, and of social evaluations of the legitimacy and reputation of start-up and established firms. In addition, he also has an interest in questions of scientific reasoning and theory development in management and organization theory.

**Fedor Dokshin** is Assistant Professor of Sociology at the University of Toronto, Canada. His research interests are in political sociology, organizations and social networks. He also has an interest in computational approaches to analysing data from novel sources including digital trace data, large-scale text data and administrative datasets.

**Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist** holds a position as Professor in Organization Theory and Management at the Gothenburg Research Institute (GRI), School of Business, Economics, and Law, University of Gothenburg, Sweden. Since 2012 she is the director of GRI. Her research interests concern organizing, especially technology, governance in professional organizations and diversity.

**Maurizio Floris** is Director of Leadership Programs at the John Grill Centre for Project Leadership, University of Sydney, Australia. His research focuses on leadership, team dynamics, stakeholder engagement, particularly in the context of complex projects. He is particularly interested in discourse, knowledge and practice, how these shape our social and organizational reality, and how this can

be used to deliver practical outcomes and social impact. Prior to his academic career, Maurizio was in industry for nearly 20 years, contributing to or leading strategy reviews, reorganizations, ICT projects and engineering projects. Being Dutch-Italian by birth, he still loves a mean pasta and a good windmill.

**Vern L. Glaser** is Assistant Professor at the Alberta School of Business, University of Alberta, Canada. He received his Ph.D. from the University of Southern California. His research investigates how organizations strategically change practices and culture.

**David Grant** is Pro-Vice Chancellor at the Griffith Business School, Australia. His research focuses on how language and other symbolic media influence the practice of leadership and organization-wide, group and individual level change. He has published in a range of peer-reviewed journals and co-edited several books including the Sage Handbook of Organizational Discourse (2004, with Cynthia Hardy, Cliff Oswick and Linda Putnam) and Discourse and Organization (1998, with Cliff Oswick and Tom Keenoy). He was elected a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences in Australia in 2008 and is an elected member of the National Training Laboratory. A lifelong Arsenal supporter, he has come to understand the true meaning of resilience.

**Barbara Gray** studies conflict, collaboration, power and institutional processes. She has published widely in management journals and co-authored *Collaborating for Our Future* (Oxford University Press, 2018). She received two life-time achievement awards. She is a mediator, consults to public, private and non-governmental organizations worldwide and a Lay Zen teacher.

**Gregory Jackson** is Professor of Management at the Freie Universität Berlin, Germany. His research examines how corporate governance and corporate social responsibility is influenced by diverse organizational and institutional contexts. His work draws on actor-centered institutional perspectives from organizational theory, economic sociology, and comparative political economy. His research has been published widely in leading journals, including *Academy of Management Review*, *Organization Science*, and *Journal of International Business Studies*. He is an Editor of *British Journal of Industrial Relations* and currently serves as Chief Editor of the *Socio-Economic Review*.

**Bill Harley** is Professor of Management in the Department of Management and Marketing at the University of Melbourne, Australia. Bill is best known for his research on employee experiences of management practices, with a focus on questions of power and control.

**Jennifer Howard-Grenville** is the Diageo Professor of Organisation Studies at the Judge Business School, University of Cambridge, UK. She contributes to organization theory through in-depth, qualitative studies of how people work from within to change organizations, communities, and occupations.

**Anja Kirsch** is a Post-Doctoral Researcher at the Department of Management, School of Business and Economics, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany.

Her current research focuses on the changing role of boards of directors, and in particular on the determinants and effects of increasing diversity in board composition. She has published her findings in *The Leadership Quarterly* and in the edited collection Seierstad, C., Gabaldon, P., & Mensi-Klarbach, H. (Eds.). (2017). *Gender Diversity in the Boardroom: The Use of Different Quota Regulations*. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan.

**Ann Langley** is Professor of Management at HEC Montréal and holder of the Chair in Strategic Management in Pluralistic Settings, Canada. Her research focuses on organizational change, leadership and strategic processes and practices in pluralistic settings, with an emphasis on qualitative research approaches. She is Co-Editor of the Journal *Strategic Organization*, and Visiting Professor at the University of Gothenburg and Adjunct Professor at the Université de Montréal.

**Jan Lodge** is a Ph.D. candidate in Organisational Theory at the Judge Business School, University of Cambridge, UK. His research uses qualitative data and analysis to explore how organizations and individuals manage contested social evaluations with a particular focus on fighting stigmatization.

**Markus Helfen** is Professor of Human Resource Management & Employment Relations in the Department of Organisation and Learning in the Faculty of Business & Management, University of Innsbruck, Austria. Markus does research in the fields of HRM, employment relations, and organization theory. Current topics and projects include global labor standards, inter-organizational HRM and employment relations as well as sustainability studies. Markus has published in leading management and industrial relations journals like *Organization Studies*, *Human Relations*, and the *British Journal of Industrial Relations*.

**Pedro Monteiro** is Research Fellow at Warwick Business School, UK, in the IKON research unit joining EMLyon (Fall 2018) as a post-doctoral fellow. He is an Ethnographer of work and organizations with an interest in classic themes in organization theory, especially bureaucracy. He co-founded the Talking About Organizations Podcast.

**Nora Lohmeyer** is a Post-doctoral Researcher at the Department of Management, School of Business and Economics, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany, where she is part of the Garment Supply Chain Governance Project ([www.garmentgov.de](http://www.garmentgov.de)). Her main research interests revolve around the politics of corporate social responsibility – studied mainly from a historical and discursive perspective – as well as the governance of labor standards in global garment supply chains.

**Cliff Oswick** is Professor of Organization Theory at Cass Business School, City University of London, UK (and previously served as Deputy Dean between 2011 and 2016). His research interests focus on the study of organizing processes and organizational change. He has published over 140 academic articles and contributions to edited volumes. He has previously served as an Associate Editor for *Journal of Change Management* and *Journal of Organizational Change Management*. He is a Member of the Chartered Institute of Personnel and

Development, an Elected Member of the National Training Laboratory, Chair of the board of trustees for the Tavistock Institute of Human Relations, and Chair-Elect of the Organization Development and Change Division of the Academy of Management. More generally, he has recently become a grandparent and he is a lifelong QPR supporter.

**Rami Kaplan** is a Political and Organizational Sociologist positioned as a post-doctoral fellow at the School of Business and Economics, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany. His research explores the historical emergence, evolution, and globalization of corporate social responsibility practices and ideologies, across such countries as the United States, United Kingdom, Germany, Venezuela, and the Philippines as well as on the transnational level. He has published in *Socio-Economic Review*, *Business & Society*, and the Oxford Handbook for Corporate Social Responsibility.

**Davide Ravasi** is Professor of Strategy and Entrepreneurship at the UCL School of Management, UK, and Visiting Professor at the Aalto School of Business, Helsinki, Finland. His research examines interrelations between organizational identity, culture and strategy in times of change, and socio-cognitive processes shaping entrepreneurship, design, and innovation.

**Trish Reay** is Professor in the Department of Strategic Management and Organization at the University of Alberta School of Business in Edmonton, Canada. She currently serves as Editor-in-Chief at Organization Studies. Her research interests include qualitative research methods, organizational and institutional change, professions and professional identity.

**Mark de Rond** is Professor of Organizational Ethnography at Judge Business School, University of Cambridge, UK. A recurring feature in his work is the variety of human experience in all-absorbing environments. His fieldwork has involved a Boat Race rowing crew, doctors and nurses in a war hospital, peace activists walking from Berlin to Aleppo, and an attempt to scull the navigable length of the river Amazon.

**Wolfgang Seibel** is a Full Professor of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Konstanz, Germany, and an Adjunct Professor of Public Administration at the Hertie School of Governance, Berlin, Germany. His recent work focuses on the theory of public administration, including variants of administrative failure and disasters, and on international bureaucracies in various forms ranging from occupation regimes during World War II and its impact on the Holocaust to humanitarian intervention and complex UN peacekeeping missions and phenomena of rare but drastic failure in public administration. His recent books include “Persecution and Rescue. The Politics of the ‘Final Solution’ in France, 1940–1944” (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press 2016), “The Management of UN Peacekeeping. Coordination, Learning & Leadership in Peace Operations”, Lynne Rienner Publ. 2017 (Ed., with Julian Junk, Francesco Mancini, Till Blume); “Verwaltungsdesaster” [Public Administration Disasters], Campus Publ. 2017 (with Kevin Klamann and Hannah Treis); “Verwaltung

verstehen. Eine theoriegeschichtliche Einführung” [Understanding Public Administration. A History of Ideas-based Introduction], 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Suhrkamp 2018.]

**Crawford Spence’s** research is principally focused on the sociology of expert groups, looking at how various financial actors (accountants, financial analysts, tax advisors, fund managers) in terms of how they negotiate social, cultural, political and economic pressures.

**David Strang** is Professor of Sociology at Cornell University, USA. His research focuses on the spread of practices in the business, political, and scientific worlds. He has developed statistical methods for the study of diffusion within an event history framework and agent-based models for the simulation of booms and busts in management fashion.

**Trin Thananusak** is Lecturer at the College of Management, Mahidol University, Thailand. He obtained Ph.D. from Cambridge Judge Business School, University of Cambridge, UK in 2016. A paper from his Ph.D. thesis won the Best Paper Award in Strategic Management at the 16th European Academy of Management Annual Meeting in June 2016.

**April L. Wright** is Associate Professor in Strategy at the UQ Business School at the University of Queensland, Australia. Her research on institutional maintenance and change and professional values has been published in leading international journals including the *Academy of Management Journal*, *Journal of Business Venturing*, *Organizational Research Methods*, and the *British Journal of Management*.

**Carla Wright** is looking forward to resuming her studies as an undergraduate student at the University of Queensland, Australia.

**Asma Zafar** is a doctoral student at the Alberta School of Business, University of Alberta, Canada. Asma’s dissertation explores organizational responses to geographical disruptions through the use of ethnographic techniques. Her work has been published in the *Journal of Business Ethics* and has been presented at several management conferences.

*This page intentionally left blank*

# ABOUT THE EDITORS

**Tammar B. Zilber** is Associate Professor of Organization Theory at the Jerusalem Business School, Hebrew University, Israel. She studies how people, organizations, and fields create, maintain, and change shared understandings, and the interrelations between these shared experiences and larger societal and cultural systems.

**John M. Amis** is Professor of Strategic Management and Organisation and Co-Director of the Centre for Strategic Leadership at the University of Edinburgh Business School, UK. His research examines large-scale organizational, institutional, and social change. He is past Chair of the Academy of Management's Organization Development & Change Division.

**Johanna Mair** is Professor of Organization, Strategy and Leadership at the Hertie School of Governance in Berlin, Germany, and co-directs the Global Innovation for Impact Lab at the Stanford Center on Philanthropy and Civil Society, USA. Her research addresses the nexus of societal challenges, institutions, and organizations.